



LETTERS

Edited by **Jennifer Sills**

NIH must confront the use of race in science

Recent protests across the United States and the world have called attention to anti-Black racism in policing, employment, housing, and education. Science and medicine also have long histories of racism (1, 2). This unfortunate yet persistent aspect of science and medicine includes the use of obsolete concepts of race to measure human biological difference and the false belief, by some, that differences in disease outcomes stem primarily from pathophysiological differences between racial groups (3, 4).

We are particularly concerned that explanations for the disproportionate rates of coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) in Black, Latino, Indigenous, and other communities of color will mistakenly point to innate racial differences instead of long-standing institutionalized racism and other underlying social, structural, and environmental determinants. Although genetic risk factors may contribute to severity of COVID-19 (5, 6), race is a poor proxy to understand the population distribution of such risk factors (7). Compelling evidence shows that racism, not race, is the most relevant risk factor (8, 9). We are hopeful that scientists will not turn to racial science—a reflection of long-standing beliefs about superiority

and inferiority that have no place in scientific and clinical practice (1, 10)—to explain COVID-19 disparities and justify policy responses to it. However, racial categories have been misused in the past.

In 2016, we called for the elimination of the use of race as a means to classify biological diversity in both laboratory and clinical research. Since that time, little has changed (11). The National Institutes of Health (NIH) made progress by releasing a request for applications in support of research leading to the creation of best practices for the study of race and other population identifiers (12). However, R01 awards could take years to address these issues, and NIH still offers no guidance about the use of racial and ethnic identifiers in research beyond recruitment. There is an urgent need for NIH to provide scientists with information about what utility racial data have beyond fostering diversity in research, how such information should or should not be used in data analysis, and what identifiers of human populations might be better suited for use in biomedical research.

To begin to address the misuse of racial measures in scientific and clinical practice, we urge the director of NIH to lead education efforts directed at both scientists and the public about the nature of human genetic diversity and the ongoing need and obligation to confront racism in science. In these troubled times, a clear statement regarding use and misuse of population identifiers in the pursuit of

A member of the Black Doctors COVID-19 Consortium, formed to help address health disparities in the African American community, tests a patient. Racial disparities in COVID-19 cases are better explained by structural racism than by genetic differences.

characterizing human difference could help alleviate ongoing and widespread confusion on such matters.

NIH should then support the National Academy of Sciences to bring together a diverse group of scientists and scholars to develop a consensus statement on best practices in genetic, clinical, and social scientific studies for characterizing human genetic diversity, including guidance for using racial categories to study racism's impact on human health. Guidelines for federally funded science should also include best practices for the integration of biological, social, structural, and environmental health determinants into the study of human health and disease.

NIH should continue and expand its work to hire more career scientists and clinicians from underrepresented minority groups. It should also substantially increase the extramural funding that supports scientists from underrepresented groups at every level of training and throughout career development. We have the tools to remedy this challenge. The time to act is now.

Michael Yudell^{1*}, Dorothy Roberts², Rob DeSalle³, Sarah Tishkoff⁴, and 70 signatories

¹Department of Community Health and Prevention, Drexel University School of Public Health,

Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA. ²Law School and Departments of Africana Studies and Sociology, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA. ³American Museum of Natural History, New York, NY 10024, USA. ⁴Departments of Genetics and Biology, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA.

*Corresponding author. Email: myudell@drexel.edu

REFERENCES AND NOTES

1. D. Roberts, *Fatal Invention: How Science, Politics, and Big Business Re-Created Race in the Twenty-First Century* (The New Press, New York, 2012).
2. E. M. Hammonds, R. M. Herzog, *The Nature of Difference: Sciences of Race in the United States from Jefferson to Genomics* (MIT Press, 2008).
3. J. L. Graves Jr., *The Emperor's New Clothes: Biological Theories of Race at the Millennium* (Rutgers University Press, New Brunswick, NJ, 2001).
4. D. A. Vyas, L. G. Eisenstein, D. S. Jones, *N. Engl. J. Med.* 10.1056/NEJMms2004740 (2020).
5. D. Ellinghaus *et al.*, *N. Engl. J. Med.* 10.1056/NEJMoa2020283 (2020).
6. M. W. Hooper, A. M. Nápoles, E. J. Pérez-Stable, *JAMA* 323, 24 (2020).
7. C. W. Yancy, *JAMA* 323, 19 (2020).
8. A. van Dorn, R. E. Cooney, M. L. Sabin, *Lancet* 395, 10232 (2020).
9. C. Wallis, "Why racism, not race, is a risk factor for dying of COVID-19," *Scientific American* (2020).
10. T. Duster, *Science* 307, 1050 (2005).
11. M. Yudell, D. Roberts, R. DeSalle, S. Tishkoff, *Science* 351, 564 (2016).
12. Ethical, Legal and Social Implications (ELSI) Research (RO1 Clinical Trial Optional) (Department of Health and Human Services, 2020); <https://grants.nih.gov/grants/guide/pa-files/PAR-20-254.html>.

SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIALS

List of signatories

www.sciencemag.org/content/369/6509/1313/suppl/DC1

10.1126/science.abd4842

Accumulation of plastic waste during COVID-19

As lockdowns took effect to slow the spread of coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19), the global demand for petroleum collapsed. As a result, oil prices plummeted, making the manufacture of virgin plastics from fossil fuels less expensive than recycling (1). This cost incentive, along with lifestyle changes that increase plastic use, has complicated the challenge of overcoming plastic pollution.

During the pandemic, personal protective equipment (PPE) has driven increased plastic pollution. In response to high PPE demand among the general public, health care workers, and service workers, single-use face mask production in China soared to 116 million per day in February, about 12 times the usual quantity (2). The World Health Organization has requested a 40% escalation of disposable PPE production (3). If the global population adheres to a standard of one disposable face mask per day after lockdowns end, the pandemic could result in a monthly global consumption



Medical waste generated by COVID-19 protocols has overwhelmed waste treatment facilities in Wuhan, China.

and waste of 129 billion face masks and 65 billion gloves (4). Hospitals in Wuhan, the center of the COVID-19 outbreak, produced more than 240 tons of single-use plastic-based medical waste (such as disposable face masks, gloves, and gowns) per day at the peak of the pandemic, 6 times more than the daily average before the pandemic occurred (5). If the increases observed in Wuhan hold true elsewhere, the United States could generate an entire year's worth of medical waste in 2 months (6).

Individual choices during lockdowns are also increasing plastic demand. Packaged take-out meals and home-delivered groceries contributed an additional 1400 tons of plastic waste during Singapore's 8-week lockdown (7). The global plastic packaging market size is projected to grow from USD 909.2 billion in 2019 to 1012.6 billion by 2021, at a compound annual growth rate of 5.5%, mainly due to pandemic response (8).

This global health crisis puts extra pressure on regular waste management practices, leading to inappropriate management strategies, including mobile incineration, direct landfills, and local burnings (9). Improper disposal of just 1% of face masks translates to more than 10 million items, weighing 30,000 to 40,000 kg (10). Waterlogged COVID-19-related plastic has been observed on beaches and in water (11), potentially aggravating the challenge of curtailing microplastics.

At the regional and national levels, prioritization of human health over

environmental health has led to the delay or reversal of policies aiming to reduce single-use plastic (9). As a result, demand for recycled plastic material has dropped, the profit margins of recycling have decreased, and the environmental footprint of plastics has increased (9). We need urgent and coordinated commitment to circular economy approaches, including recycling practices and strict policies against plastic pollution. Companies should continue efforts to curtail virgin plastic use and increase plastic recycling to live up to their corporate social and environmental responsibilities. Without a concerted effort to protect the environment during and after the pandemic, we are unlikely to meet the United Nations' Sustainable Development Goals (12).

Tanveer M. Adyel

Department of Civil Engineering, Monash University, Clayton, Melbourne, VIC 3800, Australia. Email: tanveer.adyel@monash.edu

REFERENCES AND NOTES

1. A. Kimini, "How the COVID-19 plastic boom could save the oil industry," *OilPrice.com* (2020).
2. F. Bermingham, S.-L. Tan, "Coronavirus: China's mask-making juggernaut cranks into gear, sparking fears of over-reliance on world's workshop," *South China Morning Post* (2020); www.scmp.com/economy/global-economy/article/3074821/coronavirus-chinas-mask-making-juggernaut-cranks-gear.
3. "Shortage of personal protective equipment endangering health workers worldwide" (WHO, 2020).
4. J. C. Prata, A. L. Patricio Silva, T. R. Walker, A. C. Duarte, T. Rocha Santos, *Environ. Sci. Tech.* 54, 7760 (2020).
5. M. Zuo, "Coronavirus leaves China with mountains of medical waste," *South China Morning Post* (2020).
6. S. Cutler, "Mounting medical waste from COVID-19 emphasizes the need for a sustainable waste management strategy" (Frost & Sullivan, 2020).

7. S. Bengali, "The COVID-19 pandemic is unleashing a tidal wave of plastic waste." *The Los Angeles Times* (2020).
8. "COVID-19 impact on packaging market by material type, application and region—global forecast to 2021." *Business Insider* (2020).
9. A. L. P. Silva *et al.*, *Sci. Total Environ.* **742**, 140565 (2020).
10. "In the disposal of masks and gloves, responsibility is required" (World Wildlife Fund, 2020); www.wwf.it/scuole/?53500%2FNello-smaltimento-di-mascherine-e-guanti-serve-responsabilita [in Italian].
11. G. Stokes, "No shortage of surgical masks at the beach" (*Oceans Asia*, 2020).
12. United Nations, "Sustainable development goals" (2015); www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/sustainable-development-goals/.

10.1126/science.abd9925

Microplastic's role in antibiotic resistance

Plastic pollution is universal and now viewed as an emerging environmental and human health crisis (1, 2). Successful management of plastic waste (3) is vital to meeting United Nations Sustainable Development Goal 14, which aims to protect marine ecosystems from pollution and other threats (4). Plastic pollution is projected to escalate over the upcoming decades (5, 6), but critical knowledge gaps and uncertainties remain about its effects. Evidence that microplastic surfaces in aquatic environments host microorganisms that are resistant to antibiotics (7, 8) suggests that plastic pollution could have ramifications on disease transmission and treatment in addition to environmental consequences and human exposure to contaminated air, water, and food.

Bacterial biofilms found on microplastics in aquatic ecosystems have been shown to include bacteria with antibiotic-resistant genes (7, 8). These resistant bacteria likely originate in human and animal populations treated with antibiotics and then travel downstream through wastewater into riverine and marine ecosystems (9). The increasing surface area provided by waste plastics, such as polyethylene, may enable higher rates of biofilm growth, including those containing antibiotic-resistant genes (7). The possibility that plastic pollution can facilitate resistance to antibiotics has critical implications for the spread of disease and the management and regulation of antibiotic resistance in the environment (10).

Although scientists have made important strides in understanding the direct effects of microplastics on animal and plant life (11), the indirect effects of plastic pollution, including the sources and transport dynamics of antibiotic resistance, remain unclear. Scientists and

policy-makers should prioritize the evaluation of both direct and indirect effects of plastic pollution to fully assess the environmental and public health risks.

Michael S. Bank^{1,2*}, Yong Sik Ok^{3,4}, Peter W. Swarzenski⁵

¹Institute of Marine Research, Bergen, Norway. ²University of Massachusetts, Amherst, MA 01003, USA. ³Korea University, Seoul, Korea. ⁴Association of Pacific Rim Universities Sustainable Waste Management Program, Korea University, Seoul, Korea. ⁵International Atomic Energy Agency, Principality of Monaco, 98000, Monaco. *Corresponding author: Email: michael.bank@hi.no

REFERENCES AND NOTES

1. M. S. Bank, S. V. Hansson, *Environ. Sci. Technol.* **53**, 7177 (2019).
2. I. A. Kane *et al.*, *Science* **368**, 1140 (2020).
3. S. You *et al.*, *Science* **368**, 1438 (2020).
4. United Nations Development Programme, Sustainable Development Goals, Goal 14: Life Below Water (www.undp.org/content/undp/en/home/sustainable-development-goals/goal-14-life-below-water.html).
5. J. R. Jambeck *et al.*, *Science* **347**, 768 (2015).
6. W. W. Y. Lau *et al.*, *Science*, 10.1126/science.aba9475 (2020).
7. X.-p. Guo *et al.*, *Sci. Tot. Environ.* **745**, 140916 (2020).
8. Y. Yang *et al.*, *Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol.* **104**, 6501 (2020).
9. S. Berkner *et al.*, *EMBO Rep.* **15**, 740 (2014).
10. Y.-G. Zhu, M. Gillings, J. Penuelas, *One Earth* **3**, 23 (2020).
11. S. Anbumani, P. Kakkar, *Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res.* **25**, 14373 (2018).

10.1126/science.abd9937

TECHNICAL COMMENT ABSTRACTS

Comment on "No consistent ENSO response to volcanic forcing over the last millennium"

Alan Robock

Dee *et al.* (Reports, 27 March 2020, p. 1477) claimed that large volcanic eruptions do not produce a detectable El Niño response. However, they come to the wrong conclusion because they have ignored the fundamental climate response to large volcanic eruptions: Volcanic eruptions cool the surface, thus masking the relative El Niño warming.

Full text: [dx.doi.org/10.1126/science.abc0502](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.abc0502)

Response to Comment on "No consistent ENSO response to volcanic forcing over the last millennium"

Sylvia G. Dee, Kim M. Cobb, Julien Emile-Geay, Toby R. Ault, R. Lawrence Edwards, Hai Cheng, Christopher D. Charles

Robock claims that our analysis fails to acknowledge that pan-tropical surface cooling caused by large volcanic eruptions may mask El Niño warming at our central Pacific site, potentially obscuring a volcano–El Niño connection suggested in previous studies. Although observational support for a dynamical response linking volcanic cooling to El Niño remains ambiguous, Robock raises some important questions about our study that we address here.

Full text: [dx.doi.org/10.1126/science.abc1733](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.abc1733)

Where Science Gets Social.

AAAS.ORG/COMMUNITY

AAAS' Member

Community is a one-stop destination for scientists and STEM enthusiasts

alike. It's "Where

Science Gets Social": a community where facts matter, ideas are big and there's always a reason to come hang out, share, discuss and explore.

Member
COMMUNITY
AAAS

NIH must confront the use of race in science

Michael Yudell, Dorothy Roberts, Rob DeSalle, Sarah Tishkoff and 70 signatories

Science **369** (6509), 1313-1314.
DOI: 10.1126/science.abd4842

ARTICLE TOOLS

<http://science.sciencemag.org/content/369/6509/1313>

SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIALS

<http://science.sciencemag.org/content/suppl/2020/09/09/369.6509.1313.DC1>

RELATED CONTENT

<http://science.sciencemag.org/content/sci/369/6509/1298.full>

REFERENCES

This article cites 5 articles, 2 of which you can access for free
<http://science.sciencemag.org/content/369/6509/1313#BIBL>

PERMISSIONS

<http://www.sciencemag.org/help/reprints-and-permissions>

Use of this article is subject to the [Terms of Service](#)

Science (print ISSN 0036-8075; online ISSN 1095-9203) is published by the American Association for the Advancement of Science, 1200 New York Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20005. The title *Science* is a registered trademark of AAAS.

Copyright © 2020 The Authors, some rights reserved; exclusive licensee American Association for the Advancement of Science. No claim to original U.S. Government Works